

---

**Minutes of the 116th meeting of the Council held 4th May 2007 at the HEFCW  
Offices, Llanishen**

**Present:**

**Members:** Professor Sir Roger Williams (Chairman)  
Dr Len Arthur  
Professor Philip Gummett (Chief Executive)  
Mr Tim Rees  
Mr Ken Richards  
Professor Sir Brian Smith  
Mrs Tina Stephens  
Dr Geoffrey Thomas  
Mrs Pauline Thomas

**Observers:** Dr David Bacon, Welsh Assembly Government

**Officers:** Dr David Blaney  
Mr Roger Carter  
Mr Dale Hall  
Mr Richard Hirst  
Ms Celia Hunt  
Ms Emma Raczka

**Apologies:** were received from Ms Niina Hammond Professor Mari Lloyd-Williams, Ms Bethan Owen, Professor Garel Rhys, Professor Nigel Stott.

1 INTRODUCTORY REMARKS, APOLOGIES AND DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

1.1 The Chair welcomed Mrs Pauline Thomas to her first meeting of Council.

1.2 The following members declared an interest in relation to agenda item 9 ('Reconfiguration and Collaboration' HEFCW/07/40):

- Dr Len Arthur as a member of staff at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff, including involvement for UWIC in the pan-Wales expression of interest in developing a Wales Regeneration Network.
- Professor Philip Gummett whose partner is employed at the Swansea Institute of Higher Education.
- Mr Ken Richards as a Member of University of Wales, Aberystwyth Investments Committee
- Professor Sir Brian Smith as international ambassador for Cardiff University.

The following member declared an interest in relation to agenda item 6, 'Welsh Medium Provision (HEFCW/07/37):

- Mr Ken Richards as Treasurer of University of Wales Guild of Graduates (to September 2007).

2. MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 23<sup>RD</sup> MARCH 2007  
(HEFCW/07/MIN115)

Resolved: that the minutes be accepted as a true record of the meeting held on 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2007, subject to the following amendments:

- That it be noted that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, (who attended the meeting to minute 4.) had also emphasised the importance of management and leadership and graduate apprenticeships;
- That minute 12.2 be checked and confirmed for accuracy.

3. MATTERS ARISING

There were no matters arising not covered elsewhere in the agenda.

4. CHIEF EXECUTIVE'S REPORT (HEFCW/07/CE3)

4.1 HEW/CHEW/HEFCW Strategic Dialogue meeting notes 16<sup>th</sup> March 2007

Council received and noted the draft notes of the HEW/CHEW/HEFCW Strategic Dialogue meeting held on 16<sup>th</sup> March 2007.

Resolved:

- i) To note the draft notes of the HEW/CHEW/HEFCW Strategic Dialogue meeting held 16<sup>th</sup> March 2007.

4.2 National Assembly for Wales Elections

Council noted the results which had been confirmed thus far of the elections to the National Assembly for Wales held on 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2007, and that the overall outcome pointed to a coalition or minority government for the next session.

4.3 Medical Education (including two tabled letters)

Council received an oral report on recent developments on Medical Education in South Wales.

Council noted:

- i. HEFCW's response to the UW Swansea's letter of 19 March on medical education issues.
- ii. the Chairman's letter of 28 March to the Minister, following a request at the 23 March Council meeting for initial observations on the Welsh Assembly

Government's intention to carry out an independent review of medical education in Wales.

- iii. That it had been confirmed that the independent review would be conducted by Professor Sir Howard Newby, Vice-Chancellor of the University of the West of England, Bristol (and former Chief Executive of HEFCE). However, it was not clear whether the terms of reference of the review had been finalised.

#### 4.4 Comprehensive Spending Review

Council received an oral report on the process of producing early evidence that would eventually feed into the Assembly's Comprehensive Spending Review process.

Council noted that full details of the Assembly's CSR process and timetable remained unclear, but that it would be important to prepare and collate evidence now to play into the process.

#### 4.5 Implementation of Welsh Assembly Government Response to the Graham Review of part-time provision

Council received an oral report on HEFCW's proposals to distribute £6.4 million of the total of £10.4m which the Welsh Assembly Government had made available to support this agenda.

Council noted:

- i. That some £2 million would be proposed for improving engagement with employers.
- ii. That £4.4 million would be proposed for strengthening part-time provision, with a particular emphasis on widening access to part time students (and taking into account existing arrangements such as the Financial Contingency Fund and Part Time Waver Scheme).
- iii. That the remaining £4 million would be allocated by the Welsh Assembly Government for student support.
- iv. That HEFCW was in the process of working out the details of the allocations, following a broader agreement between the Welsh Assembly Government, HEW and the HEIs about how the funding should be distributed.
- v. that short timescales meant that it was likely that officers would need to make a decision about the detailed proposals for distribution of allocations before the next Council meeting on 29 June, but that a further update would be given at that meeting.

#### 4.6 University of Wales Press Appointments to Title Panel

Council received and noted an update on the University of Wales Press Panel membership all of whose terms of appointment were due to end in July 2007.

Resolved:

- i) To reappoint the three current members of the Titles Panel of the University of Wales Press for a further term of three years from July 2007.

4.7 Audit of Student Data

Council noted the changes approved by the Audit and Risk Committee to the way in which the external audit of student data to underpin funding will be undertaken

Resolved:

- i) To approve the expenditure on student data audits of £20,000 per annum to be met from the Programmes Budget, the initial contract to commence for five years in 2007/08.

4.8 Learning and Teaching Strategy Allocations to Institutions

Council noted the exercise of delegated authority by the Chief Executive of the integration of an additional £10,000 from the learning and teaching fund into the funding for institutional learning and teaching strategies.

4.9 Institutional Visit to Cardiff University 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2007

Council noted the minutes of the Institutional Visit to Cardiff University on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2007.

4.10 Institutional Visit to the University of Glamorgan, 31 January 2008

Council noted that the re-scheduled Institutional Visit to the University of Glamorgan now would take place on Thursday 31<sup>st</sup> January 2008.

4.11 Black and other Ethnic Minority (BME) Attainment Project

Council noted details and costs of a twelve month project to consider the attainment of higher education students from BME groups, which at HEFCW's usual proportionate (5%) contribution would amount to a maximum of £6,250.

4.12 Evaluation of the Higher Education (HE) Academy

Council noted HEFCW's involvement in and details of the costs of a UK-wide evaluation of the Higher Education Academy, commissioned by HEFCE. HEFCW's expected contribution would be around £5,000.

4.13 Foundation Degrees Study

Council received and considered the final report of the Foundation Degrees Study, which would be made publicly available.

4.14 HEFCW's response to the Assembly's Independent Review of the Mission and Purpose of Further Education in Wales (the Webb Review)

Council noted HEFCW's response to the Webb Review response and further developments, and received as part of this a tabled supplementary report for the Webb panel.

4.15 Report on the Exercise of Delegated Authority – Gender Equality Scheme

Council received and noted the following exercise of delegated authority:

- i. the draft Gender Equality Scheme had been circulated for consultation with appropriate stakeholders, with responses due to be returned to the Council's Disability and Diversity Co-ordinator by 5<sup>th</sup> April 2007. (Authority delegated at 26 January 2007 Council meeting, minute 11.2ii refers)

5. WELSH VIDEO NETWORK (HEFCW/07/36)

5.1 Council received and considered a recent review of the Welsh Video Network (WVN) including proposed funding arrangements to 2010/11.

5.2 Members discussed the rationale behind the proposal, as recommended in the study, for HEFCW to selectively replace HEIs' WVN equipment. It was acknowledged that the equipment in HEIs was becoming dated, although members questioned whether the practice of top slicing funding to provide for equipment ensured sufficient institutional commitment to the WVN. Although the value of the WVN to the institutions was not questioned, and the WVN's significance in facilitating collaboration between HEIs, members agreed that they could be encouraged to make smarter use of their facilities, particularly the HEIs where usage was relatively low.

5.3 Members discussed the notion of HEFCW allocating funding to replace equipment in additional studios in which HEIs used the facilities on average more than 12 hours a month. While the benchmark of 12 hours a month was queried as low, members recognised that it was not possible to calculate the number of hours saved as a result of using WVN facilities. It was suggested that once HEFCW had selectively replaced the WVN equipment at *one* studio in each HEI, it should agree to pay *half*, rather than in full, the costs of replacing equipment in additional studios, on application from the HEI.

5.4 It was suggested that institutions could be encouraged to increase the community use of their WVN facilities, particularly where an institution has additional studios.

Resolved:

***The paragraphs below are exempt from disclosure under section 43 of the Freedom of Information Act as they contain information which is commercially sensitive.***

*i to viii*

6. WELSH MEDIUM PROVISION UPDATE (HEFCW/07/37 AND TABLED ANNEX A)

- 6.1 Council received and considered draft tabled advice to the Minister on Welsh medium provision, following on from Council's initial advice in January 2007, and arrangements for the HEFCW Welsh Medium Provision Development Fund to support the sector development plan from 2007/08.

Council noted:

- 6.2 the progress that the sector group, led by HEW, had made in taking forward developments in this area and that future funding by HEFCW would need to be consistent with the sector's strategy for Welsh medium higher education in Wales.
- 6.3 the work undertaken by the *Mantais* campaign in stimulating demand at undergraduate level.

Resolved:

- i) to delegate authority to the Chairman and the Chief Executive to approve the final advice to be submitted to the Minister;

***The paragraphs below are exempt from disclosure under sections 22 of the Freedom of Information Act as they contain information which is intended for future publication and section 36 potentially prejudicial to the effective conduct of public affairs.***

*ii and iii*

7. INITIAL TEACHER TRAINING (HEFCW/07/38 AND TABLED ANNEX A)

- 7.1 The Chief Executive reiterated the declaration that his partner is employed at the Swansea Institute of Higher Education.
- 7.2 Council received and considered an update on recent developments on initial teacher training reconfiguration and a request to approve arrangements for the allocation of ITT strategy and partnership funding for 2007/08. Council also received a report on progress on other aspects of meeting its ITT remit.

***The paragraphs below are exempt from disclosure under section 36 of the Freedom of Information Act as they contain information which is potentially prejudicial to the effective conduct of public affairs.***

Council noted:

7.3 and 7.4

8. LEADERSHIP FOUNDATION FOR HIGHER EDUCATION (HEFCW/07/39)

- 8.1 Council received and considered a proposal for the next instalment of funding for the Leadership Foundation for Higher Education (LFHE).

Council noted:

- 8.2 that the appointment of Dr Heather Graham as the new part-time Associate Director for Wales should improve links between the LFHE and HEIs in Wales and should assist the LFHE in delivering Wales-specific activities.

Resolved:

- i) To provide funding in support of the Leadership Foundation for Higher Education of up to £310k for the period 2007-12, which equated to HEFCW's normal 5% contribution to UK-wide funding initiatives; and
- ii) To enquire whether the LFHE has any evaluative information about the benefits of HEI membership.

9. RECONFIGURATION AND COLLABORATION (HEFCW/07/40 AND TWO TABLED ITEMS)

- 9.1 Dr Len Arthur reiterated the declaration that he is employed as a member of staff at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff, including involvement for UWIC in the pan-Wales expression of interest in developing a Wales Regeneration Network. The Chief Executive reiterated the declaration that his partner is employed at the Swansea Institute of Higher Education.

- 9.2 Council received and noted progress with reconfiguration and collaboration since its last meeting on 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2007.

Council noted:

- 9.3 That moving to a six-monthly schedule for considering reconfiguration and collaboration proposals would help ensure that proposed developments were major and strategic and endorsed by senior management.
- 9.4 The tabled letter from the Wales Audit Office dated 20 April 2007, which gave details of its examination of value for money in the Reconfiguration and Collaboration Fund and the forthcoming audit.

***The paragraph below is exempt from disclosure under section 36 of the Freedom of Information Act as they contain information which is potentially prejudicial to the effective conduct of public affairs.***

9.5

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

10.1 Members' Workshop, Thursday 3rd May 2007

On reflecting on the discussions held at the workshop, Council members revisited the suggestion that consideration be given to the establishment of a formal Research Committee as a committee of Council. It was suggested that, at present, establishing the Council's Research Sounding Group on a firmer basis might provide a more effective means of securing a broader range of views to inform the Council's thinking on matters of research policy and funding whilst, given its centrality and relative significance in funding terms, properly reserving to the Council itself firm control in this area.

Resolved:

To bring revised terms of reference for the Research Sounding Group to Council for approval in due course.

10.2 Funding Gap

Council expressed continuing concern over the increasing divergence in the overall grant-in-aid funding for higher education between Wales and England. It was agreed that the Chairman would contact the new Education Minister in the coming weeks to discuss further the matter of the funding gap.

10.3 Guardian League Tables 2008

Council noted with concern the relatively poor positioning of Welsh HEIs in the recently-published league tables in the *Guardian University Guide 2008*. Full details of the precise methodology used was unclear, but would be looked into. Members noted in this context that HEFCE was undertaking a study of league tables generally, including looking at the different ways they are compiled and how they are influencing institutions' behaviour.

Resolved:

- i) To discuss with HEFCE once the study had been completed; and
- ii) To liaise with HEW about the potential publicity implications of the position of Welsh HEIs in the league table.

11. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Council noted the date of the next meeting as 29<sup>th</sup> June 2007 to be held at the HEFCW Offices, Llanishen.

12. HEFCW WELSH LANGUAGE SCHEME: ANNUAL COMPLIANCE REPORT (HEFCW/07/41)

12.1 Council received and considered the draft of the second annual Welsh Language Scheme Report.

12.2 Resolved:

- i) To note the draft 2006-07 compliance report on the HEFCW Welsh Language Scheme; and
- ii) To delegate authority to the Chief Executive to approve the final version of the compliance report for submission to the Welsh Language Board.

13. AUDIT AND RISK COMMITTEE MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD 1<sup>ST</sup> DECEMBER 2006 AND UNCONFIRMED MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD 13<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2007.

- 13.1 Council received and noted the minutes of the meeting of the Audit and Risk Committee held 1<sup>st</sup> December 2006 and the unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held 13<sup>th</sup> March 2007.

Council noted:

- 13.2 from the 13 March 2007 minutes that the WAO had reported that, from 2006-07, Grant-in-Aid will no longer be included as 'income' in the Income & Expenditure Account but as an addition directly to the general funds in the balance sheet.. As a result, HEFCW will be reporting substantial deficits, or a 'net operating costs' position each year from now on. This would have no operational impact, though the change would need to be reported and explained carefully when the accounts were published in the 2006-07 Annual Report.

- 13.3 Resolved: to approve minutes of the meeting of the Audit and Risk Committee held 1<sup>st</sup> December 2006 and, subject to confirmation by the Committee, the unconfirmed minutes of the meeting held 13<sup>th</sup> March 2007.

14. THIRD MISSION COMMITTEE MEETING HELD 5<sup>TH</sup> APRIL 2007  
(HEFCW/07/43)

- 14.1 Council received and considered the tabled unconfirmed minutes of the meeting of the Third Mission Committee held 5<sup>th</sup> April 2007, and also the Chair of the Committee's Annual Report to Council for the period 2005/06.

Council noted:

- 14.2 That the Chief Executive and Chair had exercised delegated authority to make some slight amendments to the Third Mission Fund allocations for 2007/08 to 2009/10, in light of data errors.

14.3 Resolved:

- i) To approve, subject to confirmation by the Committee, the minutes of the meeting of the Third Mission Committee held 5<sup>th</sup> April 2007; and
- ii) To receive the Third Mission Committee Chair's Annual Report for 2005/06.

15. LEARNING AND TEACHING COMMITTEE MEETING HELD 30<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2007  
(HEFCW/07/44)

- 15.1 Council received and considered the unconfirmed minutes of the meeting of the Learning and Teaching Committee held 30<sup>th</sup> March 2007.

- 15.2 Resolved: To approve, subject to confirmation by the Committee, the minutes of the meeting of the Learning and Teaching Committee held 30<sup>th</sup> March 2007.

16. WIDENING ACCESS COMMITTEE UNCONFIRMED MINUTES MEETING HELD  
20<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2007 (HEFCW/07/45)

- 16.1 Council received and considered the unconfirmed Minutes of Widening Access Committee meeting held 20<sup>th</sup> March 2007.
- 16.2 Resolved: To approve, subject to confirmation by the Committee, the unconfirmed minutes of the Widening Access Committee meeting held 20<sup>th</sup> March 2007.
  
- 17. SOURCES OF RESEARCH INCOME OF HEIS IN WALES (HEFCW/07/46)
- 17.1 Council received and noted sources of research income for higher education institutions (HEIs) in Wales in 2005/06, together with comparative data for earlier years.
- 17.2 Resolved: To note the sources of research income for HEIs in 2005/06.
  
- 18. HR COMMITTEE MEETING HELD 20<sup>TH</sup> FEBRUARY 2007 (HEFCW/04/47) (MEMBERS ONLY)
- 18.1 Council received the minutes of the Human Resources Committee meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> February 2007.
- 18.2 Resolved: To note the minutes of the Human Resources Committee meeting held 20<sup>th</sup> February 2007.
  
- 19. ANNUAL REPORT OF THE HR COMMITTEE MEETING APRIL 2006 – MARCH 2007 (HEFCW/07/48) (MEMBERS ONLY)
- 19.1 Council received and considered the Annual Report on the work of the Human Resource (HR) Committee for the period April 2006 to March 2007.
- 19.2 Resolved: to note the Annual Report on the work of the Human Resource (HR) Committee for the period April 2006 to March 2007.

Signature..... Date.....